1.4 BLACKNESS AND OTHERNESS

By Meira Goldberg

Foundation for Iberian Music, CUNY Grad Center, New York, USA

1. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

How are the politics of blackness represented in the body that dances flamenco?1 Or to put the question another way, what does flamenco dance tell us about the construction of race in the Atlantic world? The idea of race, of blackness as meaning religious confusion or deviation and, therefore, a subjugated social status, developed in the Iberian Peninsula during the Reconquista, a struggle of almost eight hundred years to expel Islam and Judaism. During this time “Cleanliness of blood” attested to loyalty to the Catholic state, while non-Christian lineage was synonymous with depravity and abjection. Race was defined in terms of Christianity and its opposite, thus classifying ethnic and religious differences within a caste system whose governance served to unseat and, at the same time, incorporate the rich Judeo-Islamic cosmopolitan past.

Aligned, both socially and metaphorically, with a large population of enslaved people from West and Central Africa, and with gypsy immigrants, whose mysterious origins and obscure appearance provided them with a sometimes useful, often dangerous ambiguity, the "Moors" of medieval Spain, that is, its Muslim inhabitants, became “Blacks,” implying both a degraded moral condition and racial identity.

With the emergence of Spain as a Catholic empire founded on the basis of the Atlantic slave trade, the religious imagery of the Reconquista wars was used to justify the brutal conquest of the Americas, and for the mass enslavement of Native Americans, Africans, and their descendants. Since the ideology of purity of blood became a guiding principle of colonization and slavery, this allowed the development of something that closely resembles modern ideas of race. The conceptualization of Central and West African ethnic traits, such as skin color, to define Blackness

---

as an abject social status operated through Christian theology: For the Catholic state, that light was Jesus Christ, who offered the possibility of redemption from primordial chaos².

In Spain, the symbolic connection of the Moor seen as the incarnation of Blackness with the enslavement of Africans thus constituted visible proof of the morality and inevitability of European and Christian domination of the "Western" hemisphere. Thus, Spain established an ideological framework that would be used by all colonial slave-owning powers.

2. RACE AND REDEMPTION – THE SHEPHERD FOOL

Already in the medieval representations of Christmas (as antecedents of Spanish theater), there was the bobo shepherd, who expressed with his dance the Christian narrative of redemption³. The bobo speaks Castilian incorrectly and his dance is also incorrect, described in terms of a confused jumble of "gambetas" (leaps) and "çapatetas", which Sebastián de Covarrubias in his Tesoro de la Lengua Castellana o Española (1611) defines as the blows that the dancer gives "with the palms of the hands, on the feet, on the shoes, to the sound of some instrument"⁴. Performed in churches and churchyards, this Christmas festival stars a lazy, cowardly, ignorant, glutinous, lewd, and often scatological gracioso or fool, "full of terror at the sight of the angel and the star," who finally experiences an epiphany, offering a joyously danced and sung conclusion as he approaches the manger with his simple offerings⁵. Hispanist Charlotte Stern writes that in depictions such as Fray Iñigo de Mendoza's Vita Christi (Zaragoza, 1482),

The eager-eyed, gawking Spanish biblical pastor remains rapt, an amazed witness to the miracle of God's incarnation, and then is literally swept off the ground by the sheer wonder of it all, breaking into an ecstatic dance to express his unleashed joy and enthusiasm: "repica la çapateta / ahuer de marras apuetro" (making abnormal leaps like a colt)⁶.

---

The entertainment value of the goofy pastor, his ability to capture and therefore indoctrinate the audience lies in his comic confusion, in his inability to see what his audience instantly recognizes: that Christ has been born. Will the goofy pastor understand what he has seen or not? Will he be redeemed or not? The bobo pastor asked rude and impertinent questions; his role was essential to make understandable to the humblest peasants in the audience "the doctrines of the Incarnation, Redemption, Transubstantiation and Immaculate Conception".7

His very figure and his narrative were thus tools of evangelization and, consequently, of the colonization of the Americas, staged in religious processions throughout the New World.8

To be confused is to be unredeemed; the shock of the bobo accurately describes the notions of ethno-religious difference prevalent during the early modern era. Blood cleanliness is "an internal attribute that cannot be seen," states Javier Irigoyen-García in his excellent book on pastoral discourse and ethnicity in Golden Age Spain, "projected onto a repertoire of cultural objects and practices".9 Thus, the boisterous gambetas and zapatetas of the bobo shepherd imply a suspect lineage and, in fact, the villain’s scenes thus often included the wit of "naming the generations": a burlesque of the certification of blood purity, which Hispanist Lucas Marchante-Aragón refers to as a "widespread exercise.... widespread among the new Spanish Renaissance nobility who needed to cleanse their past of...any Semitic stain".10 The bobo speaks a “debased dialect, dresses badly,” and “eats pork and wine voraciously” —which ostensibly demonstrates that he is neither Muslim nor Jew. "He boasts of possessing the purity of blood that makes him superior to the converts," and boasts of his "rustic genealogy by reciting a long list of relatives and ancestors with ridiculous names".11

The ambiguity of these ridiculously pretentious genealogies, Irigoyen writes, “clearly connect...the dramatic pastor with the doctrine of blood purity”; the aestheticization of the figure of the pastor is “inherent to racism”.12

---

11 Irigoyen-García, The Spanish Arcadia, 5, 82.
However, by representing the Christian narrative of redemption, the goofy pastor simultaneously calls into question the racial determinism of blood cleansing. Although the staging of the pastoral may have had “as its goal to oppose the Moorish cultural and genealogical legacy,” writes Irigoyen-García, these representations equally promoted “a homogeneous concept of a national identity that subsumes distinctions between social classes”.13

The game of possibilities that the bobo represents, therefore, embodies another aspect of the polemics on slavery in the 16th and 17th centuries: if there is no possibility of redemption through the catechumen and cultural assimilation, the colonial enterprise, founded on slavery, loses its moral basis and hence its indispensable support from the Catholic Church. A significant moment in this discourse was the debate in 1550 before Charles V between the Dominican friar Bartolomé de las Casas, who in 1542 had written the “Brevisima relación de la destrucción de las Indias”, arguing that even non-Christians were also part of Christendom, and Juan Ginés de Sepúlveda, who had translated Aristotle’s Politics in 1548, arguing that the indigenous Americans were “natural slaves” in the Aristotelian sense.14

3. BULLA, ZAPATEADO, AND THE SINFULNESS OF NEGRITUDE

In 1611, Covarrubias expressly connects the noisy and turbulent footwork of the ‘bobo’ pastor with the redemption narrative. Covarrubias defines his “çapato” as “la cosa más humilde que ay, trayándolo debaxo del pie” (“the most humble thing under the foot”) and thus symbolic of the “humility and baxeza” (“beauty”) of “Cristo nuestro Redentor” (Christ the Redeemer).15 This type of footwork is dancing, slapping of palms and hitting the shoes to the sound of some instrument; and çapatetas are “the hits of the çapatos.” In 1739, the Royal Academy of Spanish (RAE) followed Covarrubias in defining “zapateta” as “‘The blow, or slap that is given on the foot, or shoe when jumping at the same time as a sign of rejoicing”, adding, in its definition of “zapatear”, that it is used “more frequently in the dance called ‘The villain’”.16 The RAE underlines the connotation of humility inherent in this boisterous rejoicing in the villain, citing the words of Sancho Panza in

Don Quixote de la Mancha: “if having to tap, I would know your fault, as I tap like a bird but in dancing I’m no good.”

Likewise, in the definition of “zapateador” the RAE cites another passage from Don Quixote, which firmly identifies the "malheridas danzas" of zapateado, "assi de espadas" with the bailes de cascabel, the popular dances. These bells, Miguel Querol Gavaldá has explained about the music described by Cervantes, are like the bobo’s leaps and noisy footwork. They signal confusion, not only in the sense of being people from the countryside or rednecks, and not in a religious sense simply but also racially, because they were used to represent the Moors. "In the olden days, the jesters’ hats were garnished with rattles," and the dancers who performed the "morisca" or "cascabelada"—carried "strings of rattles attached to their calves on a piece of leather.

As described by Thoinot Arbeau in his Orchésographie (1589), the moresque dancers, with "their faces smeared in black" and "tights covered with bells," danced "tapping their feet." Such blackface footwork was profane: "moresque dancers will not be admitted to the heaven imagined in the farce "Troys Galans et un Badin," writes musicologist Howard Mayer Brown in French Secular Theater 1400-1550, "because their movements were likely to collapse the floor."

Brown documents a depiction of the bobo’s ethnic and moral confusion and being loud, scatological, and even obscene in another French farce of this period, in which a character "refers to himself with 'le cul aussi decouvert / Comme un danseur de morisque'" (with his ass in the air / like a moresque dancer).

4. DOUBLE CONSCIOUSNESS AND TRANSIENCE

Writing about the proto-history of the bulería in the "cantes, toques y bailes entre la gente crúa, valentona, escandalosa y flamenca" the illustrious flamencologist Luis Suárez Ávila points out that since at least the 16th century the cantes and dances that give rise to flamenco

---

17 RAE, "Zapatear," vol. 6 (1739), 558, citing Miguel de Cervantes Saavedra, Don Quijote de la Mancha, “Segunda Parte, Capítulo LXII,” in Obras completas de Cervantes: Don Quijote de la Mancha. Tomo VI Texto corregido con especial estudio de la primera edición, por D. J. E. Hartzenbusch (Argamasilla de Alba: M. Rivadeneyra, 1863), 204.
20 Thoinot Arbeau (Jehan Tabourot), Orchesography, Mary Stewart Evans, trad. (Nueva York: Dover Publications, Inc. [1589] 1967), 177.
breathed the atmosphere of "bulla, jolgorio, in short, jaleo". Querol, writing about the morisca, agrees, noting "the custom of firing guns and making all kinds of noises at the end of the [morisca]," whose main motif, as we saw above in Cervantes, was often "a sword fight between Christians and Mohammedans" not only wearing the bells of the bobo but also often with the face blackened in black, "to look like a Moor." This commotion or uproar, point to the core of the racialized concepts of the dance. They signify primarily the confusion of not having accepted Christ and the consequent danger of a suspicious lineage. Depictions of jaleo or uproar like this, contain all the potential for condemnation, and thus constitutes the term by which slavery was justified boisterousness and confusion construct a disturbing figure that traces from the Negro carols of the Golden Age to the American "Jim Crow" era and the theme of the obedient and "jolly" slave. This jaleo or commotion is a consummately kinesthetic concept and also heralds the noisy, unbridled uproar of unbridled sensuality: lasciviousness is another of the universal indicators of Blackness, conceived as a sinful error.

But if the danced deviance of the bulla represents a moral and racial aberration, it also invokes an ambiguity that can conceal resistance and dissent. Suggestive, comic, and irrepressible confusion is, of course, the key to the popular appeal of Blackness in dance. The jaleo or confusion recreates what performative theorist Jayna Brown describes as "the sly trap": the Black performer's "multisignifying practices of dissimulation," performing "in the field of racialized fantasies." Brown's idea, that performance that exploits such racial imagery simultaneously allows a "space for satirical commentary on the meaninglessness of such representations," is related to what W. E. B. Du Bois calls "double consciousness," one of the most useful tools of performative theories of Blackness that can be employed when considering flamenco.

23 Querol, La música en la obra de Cervantes, 117-18.
24 On "el esclavo alegre," cf. Fra Molinero, La imagen de los negros. On black carols, cf. Horacio J. Becco,
Indeed, with regard to these practices of dissimulation, one might wonder whether, as far as Spain at least is concerned, is it the chicken or the egg that begins the circle first? The representation of a cunning or intentional confusion, together with "disillusionment" (the breaking of the theatrical illusion), is one of the hallmarks of Spanish literature. This is perfectly logical. On the one hand, since the dangerous stain of impure blood was invisible, appearances cannot be trusted. On the other, the economic explosion of Spain's American colonies, driven by enslaved labor, paradoxically sucked prosperity from the metropolis. Don Quixote, an impoverished knight, obsessively clinging to his nobility of spirit in the most severe circumstances of the real world, bases his crusade on the honorable ideals of God, Country and King; but in the ironic comments of his squire, Sancho Panza, as well as in the patent incongruity of his adventures (think of the famous saying "fighting windmills"), lies a critical, skeptical and underhanded attitude towards the state.

This ambiguous perspective operates through a profound identification with picaresque figures, spokespersons for a deeply felt dissent and disillusionment. Sometimes female or sometimes male, sometimes urban or sometimes rural, the refracted images of this figure surface frequently, reflecting a "mobile, fragmentary, and contradictory" interpretation of the world. The uncouth shepherd, faced with the advance of Goliath in Diego Sánchez de Badajoz's “Farsa del rey David” (1554), turns to the audience and exclaims, “I'm sweating... and I have to pee!” This superdialogical and direct commentary was based on the techniques of concealment and multiplication of meaning. These country people or village 'hicks', the enslaved characters, and the outcasts of Spain were "disqualified within the context of the dramatic illusion," musicologist Elisabeth Le Guin strongly opines, "but the metatheatrical disjunction and the disillusionment that goes with it" gave them a "special power to challenge the whole illusion."

La bulla embraces nonsense: expressions, such as the uninhibited and sexually triumphant "cucu-ru-cu-cu-cú" (or gurugú) of the rooster's crowing (or perhaps the contented cooing of the well-loved dove), can be traced as a denotative characteristic of Negritude in Spanish

---

30 Cf., for example, John Brotherton’s exposition of the goofy shepherd as Common Man: The Pastor-Bobo, 60–1.
31 Nicholas Spadaccini and Jenaro Taléns, Through the Shattering Glass: Cervantes and the Self-Made World (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1993), xiv.
34 Elisabeth Le Guin, The Tonadilla in Performance: Lyric Comedy in Enlightenment Spain (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2014), 154, cita a Juan Manuel, Príncipe de Villena, “Exemplo XXXII,” y observa que “el Libro de los exemplos, o El Conde Lucanor (1335), una antología española medieval de fábulas y parábolas, fue la fuente para la alegoría de Hans Christian Andersen de ‘El nuevo traje del emperador’.”
literature. Such nonsense is euphemistic: its semantic force resides in what remains unsaid. Euphemistic verbal expressions are aligned with the bodily deviations of gambetetas and zapatetas, these being ambiguous expressions of racialized confusion and sonorous goofiness. These nonsenses include the blasphemous expletive—the powerful, if harshly repressed, voice of resistance. In other words, if the bulla embodies the Blackness of not having "seen the light" of Christ, it also expresses a forceful critique of and resistance to the Christian state.

We are asked by Fred Moten in The Undercommons, which could be translated as Underground Shared Spaces (2013), "'What does disorder mean in the language of the sovereign?' " We must pay attention to cacophony", Moten writes; we must "inhabit and almost even cultivate...the site that manifests itself here and now, in the space and time of the sovereign, as absence, darkness, death, things that are not." 37

Moten starts from a concept of diaspora as a "radical state of homelessness," an expression of an "ethic of the self...attuned to the margins." Flamenco, whose minstrel-like blackness is represented by gypsy imagery, knows this denationalization thoroughly and has always carried out this encoding. How, then, can flamenco illuminate theories of race and identity representation? How can we consider its double-intended, purposefully deceptive din? When cultural richness—of verse, rhythm, or gesture, for example—is extracted, fused, and rendered in the likeness of the oppressor, what of its animating spirit, what of its soul remains?

The flamenco imaginary revolves around the imagined gypsy who dances on the edge of a razor that delineates black and white worlds. Balancing between ostentatious and sinful confusion, on the one hand, and the humility of the epiphany on the other, this figure relates to an earlier trope: the foolish ('bobo') shepherd, who, seeing the angel's appearance, must decide between accepting the enlightenment of Jesus Christ or remaining in darkness. The symbolic linking of this religious danger with the dark dungeon of slavery constitutes the evangelical narrative that defeated the Moors and enslaved the Americas; an ideological framework that would be deployed in all states of slave domination.

37 Harney y Moten, The Undercommons, 137.
The precarious condition of the state of confusion in which the bobo finds himself, attractive for the comic, also bears the pathos of the final gamble of his decision heaven or hell, safety or extermination creating a swarming vision of a body politics not determined by exploitation, and not conforming to colonial identity. The black sounds of flamenco live in this moment of noise, confusion and uproar that conceal the resistance to subjugation, the lament for what has been lost, and the values and aspirations rendered invisible by slavery and intended cultural genocide.
5. CITED WORKS – BIBLIOGRAPHY


- Díez Borque, José María. Sociología de la comedia española del siglo XVII. Madrid, Cátedra, 1976.


• Cervantes Saavedra, Miguel de. Obras completas de Cervantes: Don Quijote de la Mancha. Tomo VI Texto corregido con especial estudio de la primera edición, por D. J. E. Hartzenbusch. Argamasilla de Alba: M. Rivadeneyra, 1863.

• Cotarelo y Mori, Emilio. Colección de Entremeses, Loas, Bailes, Jácaras y Mojigangas desde fines del siglo XVI à mediados del XVIII, Madrid: Bailly Ballière, 1911.

• Covarrubias Orozco, Sebastián de. Tesoro de la Lengua Castellana o Española. Madrid: Luis Sanchez, impressor del Rey N.S., 1611.


• Hendrix, William S. *Some Native Comic Types in the Early Spanish Drama*. Tesis doctoral, University of Chicago, 1922.


• Rey, Juan José. *Danzas cantadas en el renacimiento español*. Madrid: Sede M, 1978